

1-1-1997

Review of Reading with a Passion : Rhetoric, Autobiography, and the American West in the Gospel of John

Douglas E. Christie

Loyola Marymount University, DEchristie@lmu.edu

Repository Citation

Christie, Douglas E., "Review of Reading with a Passion : Rhetoric, Autobiography, and the American West in the Gospel of John" (1997). *Theological Studies Faculty Works*. 123.
http://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/theo_fac/123

Recommended Citation

Christie, Douglas E. Review of Jeffrey Staley, *Reading with a Passion: Rhetoric Autobiography, and the American West in the Gospel of John* (New York: Continuum, 1995), in *The Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 59 (1997): 400-402.

major tensions and trajectories within intertestamental Judaism. At the very beginning, Scott clearly sets out his guiding principle, namely, "that a highly significant reason for the rise of distinctive customs and controversies was the variety of reactions to two major crises, the destruction of the Jewish state and temple by the Babylonians in the sixth century B.C., and the arrival of Hellenistic culture in the fourth century B.C." (p. 23).

Scott elaborates his argument in three parts. In section I, entitled "The Background and Setting of Intertestamental Judaism," S. concentrates on history, making use of traditional Jewish and Greco-Roman sources, but also more recent discoveries which offer new insight into the complexity of religious development in this period. Maps and charts enhance the usefulness of this discussion of geography and history. In the survey of Jewish history, S. gives great weight to the biblical account but recognizes also that the biblical sources are biased in reporting from a spiritual point of view, for example, when they consider all the kings of Israel evil in the sight of God though a less biased secular critique would acknowledge more political and military success in the case of Omri or of Jeroboam II.

The title of the second section reflects the author's principal focus: "The Crises and Responses of Intertestamental Judaism." In this section, S. reflects on the shift of emphasis in law, worship, and interpretation of Scripture, and the growth of messianic expectation. In his portrait of common life in first-century Israel he touches on social and economic factors which can enlighten the student of the NT.

In the third section S. gives attention to the religious thought of intertestamental Judaism as a "background for Christian customs and controversies." S. considers the Christian attitude that "the final age" has been inaugurated by Jesus crucial for explaining the specific Christian response to the issues which characterized intertestamental Judaism.

Scott's thirty years of teaching experience is evident in the way he has very compactly brought together an enormous amount of material about an area of biblical study that is constantly expanding. Despite the frequent disclaimers that his presentation cannot do justice to the depth of many facets of this subject, S. has served Christian students well by opening a door into the Jewish world and literature leading up to the development of Christianity.

Paul Zilonka, C.P., St. Joseph's Seminary, Yonkers, NY 10704

JEFFREY L. STALEY, *Reading with a Passion: Rhetoric, Autobiography, and the American West in the Gospel of John* (New York: Continuum, 1995). Pp. xii + 270. \$27.95.

What do Winnie the Pooh, the American West, the Gospel of John, reader-response, social-scientific, feminist, and autobiographical criticisms, the novels of Tony Hillerman, and Navajo dogs have in common? They are all combusting within

the brilliant imaginative world Jeffrey Staley inhabits. And they are incorporated into a book that is, as rock climbers or river rafters would say, "beyond category." That is good news for anyone interested in this Gospel or in the possible future of NT scholarship.

Staley, author of the highly regarded book *The Print's First Kiss: A Rhetorical Investigation of the Implied Reader in the Fourth Gospel* (Atlanta: Scholars, 1988), both builds upon and renounces his earlier work in order to create what may well come to be regarded as an entirely new way of doing biblical scholarship. He builds upon his earlier work in the sense that he remains convinced of the usefulness of applying the formalist insights of reader-response criticism to the NT, but he renounces what he now perceives to have been a too-insular, restricted use of this methodology. Taking seriously a criticism made of his earlier work by Mary Ann Tolbert: "What Staley's generalized reader masks . . . is the critic himself: Staley's reader reads the way Staley does" (quoted on p. 12), S. (astonishingly, given the general reluctance within the world of academic scholarship to admit the shortcomings of one's hard-won positions) *accepts* the truth of this criticism and sets off to discover a more adequate and inclusive critical approach. Inclusive it is, not only of a diverse and clearly synthesized discussion of contemporary interpretive "schools" but also of the author's own life-world.

This latter point is worth emphasizing. S. has taken to heart the work of feminist, postcolonial, and autobiographical critics who have argued in different ways that the myth of the omniscient, objective reader of texts is simply unsustainable. The fact that this assumption remains unquestioned in much contemporary biblical scholarship (and perhaps characterized much of Staley's own earlier scholarship) motivates Staley to embark on a new course in his reading of the Fourth Gospel. But he has grander designs than this: he wants to propel the whole discipline of biblical scholarship off into new, yet-to-be charted territory. With the playfulness and barely concealed irony that runs through the entire work, he asks, "Can packaging the gospel in autobiographical literary criticism and imprinting it with postmodern and post-colonial postmarks send it off to new, unforeseen dustynations?" (p. 22). Still he is quite serious. Framing his own concerns within the work of Patricia Williams (*The Alchemy of Race and Rights: Diary of a Law Professor* [Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1990] 7-8), Staley says, "I have tried to write in such a way that my writing will reveal the intersubjectivity of my exegetical constructions and so lead 'the reader both to participate in the construction of meaning and to be conscious of that process.' Like hers [i.e., Williams's], my writing is an attempt 'to create a genre of [exegetical] writing to fill the gaps of traditional [biblical] scholarship'" (p. 23).

Staley succeeds brilliantly in this aim. This, finally, is the really significant thing about this work: he compels us to reconsider the entire goal and genre of biblical criticism. He demonstrates in part 1 of the book that he is an accomplished and imaginative reader of biblical texts by synthesizing a variety of critical voices to shed new light on selected Johannine texts. But it is in part 2 of the book that he really shines, contributing something new and original to the world of biblical scholarship: a self-consciously autobiographical approach to NT criticism. Grounded in sophisticated and capacious theoretical analysis, intimate knowledge of the critical issues

pertaining to the Fourth Gospel, and perceptive, remarkably self-revealing autobiographical reflection, S.'s interpretive wager sparkles with the narrative pace, philosophical depth, and unsettling power of good literature. If this is "reading with a passion," let us have more of it.

Douglas Burton-Christie, Loyola Marymount University, Los Angeles, CA 90045

ULRIKE WAGNER, *Die Ordnung des "Hauses Gottes": Der Ort von Frauen in der Ekklesiologie und Ethik der Pastoralbriefe* (WUNT 2/65; Tübingen: Mohr [Siebeck], 1994). Pp. x + 291. Paper DM 88.

In this revised dissertation from Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität, Münster, Wagner tries to specify the opportunities and restrictions of women in the "household of God" communities addressed in the Pastoral Epistles. Her hypothesis is this: the *oikos*-ecclesiology of the Pastorals must be understood against the background of a conflict of interests between men and women, a conflict that consisted of a contest over leadership positions. The power struggle explains the argumentative strategy evident in the Pastoral Epistles: an androcentrically reactionary conception of *oikos* is used as a model for structuring the church, while the church, now sacralized as *oikos theou*, props up the structure of the private *oikos*. One helps to maintain the other, and both put women in their place.

Relying on form-critical distinctions between the "household management topos" and the "station code schema" worked out by David C. Verner (*The Household of God and the Social World of the Pastoral Epistles* [SBLDS 71; Chico: Scholars, 1983]), W. argues that the Pastorals do not represent the latest instance in an unbroken line of formal or tradition-historical development of a single code of household management that runs from Colossians-Ephesians to 1 Peter before being taken up in the Pastorals. Rather, we have here an independent "new reception" (p. 63) and adaptation of a Greco-Roman literary topos whose closest parallel W. finds in the Neo-Pythagorean epistolary moralizing traditions concerning the deportment of women. This independent adaptation is a correction of earlier Christian household codes toward increased authoritarianism, and it is motivated by the author's perception of a single and central problem, the *Frauenproblem*. W.'s point is a methodological one: against the view that a single schema of household management is the font of all later Christian use, she posits the much more plausible view that Christian writers availed themselves of moralizing tools from the surrounding cultures whenever they could use them in their projects of church construction.

Most of the book consists of a detailed analysis of 1 Tim 2:9-3:1a and 1 Tim 5:3-16. The first passage is directed against wealthy women who claimed within the church positions of authority and influence which fitted their socioeconomic status and were consistent with the documented practice of women benefactors, especially in Asia