



**Digital Commons@**

Loyola Marymount University  
LMU Loyola Law School

---

Philosophy Faculty Works

Philosophy

---

2004

## Design by Nature

Timothy Shanahan

Loyola Marymount University, [timothy.shanahan@lmu.edu](mailto:timothy.shanahan@lmu.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/phil\\_fac](https://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/phil_fac)



Part of the [Philosophy Commons](#)

---

### Digital Commons @ LMU & LLS Citation

Shanahan, Timothy, "Design by Nature" (2004). *Philosophy Faculty Works*. 270.

[https://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/phil\\_fac/270](https://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/phil_fac/270)

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Philosophy at Digital Commons @ Loyola Marymount University and Loyola Law School. It has been accepted for inclusion in Philosophy Faculty Works by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons@Loyola Marymount University and Loyola Law School. For more information, please contact [digitalcommons@lmu.edu](mailto:digitalcommons@lmu.edu).

O'Brien refers to countless experiments nature has "composed and performed" and implies that through comparative genomics, people will gain a greater understanding of how living organisms evolve and how they are connected. The implications for humanity are emphasized in the opening and closing chapters of the book. The Human Genome Project and human gene therapy are presented to reveal their potential, still in its infancy, for curing disease. It is impossible to read one of the stories and put the book down without wondering how lessons learned from the evolution of other species might be relevant to us. The potential to point the way for a cure to some human diseases, including AIDS, seems inevitable.

Each of the stories in *Tears of the Cheetah* contributes to an understanding of how science works in the real world, at least in part by showing how graduate students, researchers, and technicians work to solve problems. These are fa-



miliar stories to O'Brien, who was directly involved in each one. In fact, they are largely a chronology of his career, starting as a self-proclaimed "naïve" fruit-fly geneticist and developing into an internationally renowned conservation biologist. O'Brien also touches on the difficulties involved in translating scientific knowledge into political action, portraying international scandal and courtroom intrigue as he systematically introduces familiar concepts reported in the news—polymerase chain reaction, DNA fingerprinting, and microsatellite markers, to name a few. A brief glossary explains the less familiar terminology.

*Tears of the Cheetah* is an excellent introduction to its subject, accessible to people without a background in genetics. It quickly reveals the potential of molecular biology for understanding mammalian evolution, assisting conservation efforts, aiding forensic science, and curing human disease. *Tears of the Cheetah*

is also an enormously inspiring and entertaining read. As I mused on the book, I was struck by the relevance of the stories to many current issues involving conservation, disease, and forensics—issues that are relevant to the lives of undergraduates at the university where I teach, and doubtless at other campuses as well. *Tears of the Cheetah* will provoke discussion among nonmajor students and other readers who are searching for a way to connect science to their lives. It is a unique contribution to the literature and a superb introduction to the vast potential of molecular biology as a tool to help us understand how the natural world works. Finally, it is a reminder of human mortality and of our place among the other mammals that are so much like us.

THOMAS C. WOOD  
New Century College  
George Mason University  
Fairfax, VA 22030

## DESIGN BY NATURE

**Organisms and Artifacts: Design in Nature and Elsewhere.** Tim Lewens. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 2004. 183 pp., illus. \$32.00 (ISBN 0262122618 cloth).

Biologists routinely deploy the language of intentional design in describing and explaining the characteristics of the entities they study. For example: The eyespots on the wings of some moths function to misdirect the pecks of avian predators, increasing the moths' chances of escape. Upon emerging from their long subterranean sojourn, male 17-year cicadas have just one purpose: to find a mate and pass on their genes, thereby completing the bizarre life cycle that defines their existence. The exquisitely sensitive infrared heat sensors of pit vipers are superbly designed for detecting warm-blooded prey, even in total darkness.

The characteristics of organisms have functions, have purposes, are well or poorly designed, are *for* something. This is in striking contrast to the physical sciences. Physicists are not concerned with explaining the function of electrons; chemists do not struggle to identify the purpose of benzene molecules; geologists do not marvel at how well designed geodes are. Teleological language dropped out of the physical sciences in the 17th century when, for example, talk of the "purpose" of the celestial bodies signaled to the leading natural philosophers of the day a sterile and retrograde understanding of the natural world. By contrast, teleological language has been going strong in biology for the last two and a half millennia. Odd.

A popular philosophical pastime is to try to show that teleological language is not really essential to biology, that all talk of functions, purposes, design, and related concepts can be translated into nonteleological language of the sort that characterizes the physical sciences. Perhaps it can. But biologists continue to use teleological language nonetheless. They continue to think of living things as akin to human artifacts, that is, to objects intentionally created in order to serve some function, to have a purpose, and about which it makes sense to ask whether, or to what extent, they are well designed. None of this would be in the least bit puzzling if it could be assumed that living things reflect in their structure and behavior the will of a designer whose intentions they embody. But most biologists assume nothing of the sort, and when pressed on the issue will patiently explain that all of these teleological terms can be replaced by nonteleological terms through a suitable (albeit tedious) process of translation. Still, the language of "design" persists. How are we to make sense of such intentional language without positing an "intender" doing the intending?

In *Organisms and Artifacts: Design in Nature and Elsewhere*, Tim Lewens tackles this and related questions. Although Lewens is University Lecturer in History and Philosophy of Science at Cambridge University, historical analysis plays no significant role in his treatment. The

book focuses instead on philosophical issues connected with what he calls “the artifact model” in biology: the approach that treats the organic world as though it were designed. Throughout the book it is evident that Lewens’s concern is to acknowledge what is right about artifact thinking in biology, to point out its limitations, and to find the *via media* (middle way) between wholesale adoption and wholesale rejection of this approach. Such balance makes Lewens’s insightful book rewarding to read but difficult to summarize in a short review.

Begin with the fact that despite its pervasiveness in biology, the artifact model—which includes talk of species facing “problems” that they “solve” using various “strategies”—is also controversial. For example, Richard Lewontin has argued that the very concept of an adaptive problem, upon which so much of the artifact model (and adaptationism more generally) is built, is bankrupt because in fixed environments, species do not encounter preexisting adaptive problems that they then solve. Rather, organ-

isms actively construct their environments according to their needs. Lewens concedes that organisms frequently manipulate, rather than merely conform to, their environments, yet notes that organisms do face specific selective pressures; evolving in response to them is a way in which species solve adaptive problems. Thus a concept of an environmental problem can be constructed that preserves the problem-solving element of the artifact model.

This does not, however, mean that the artifact model is in the clear. Lewens points out a number of additional shortcomings, among them that the model tends to lead its devotees to ignore drift, it exaggerates the independence of organismic traits while encouraging biologists to ignore developmental relations between traits, and it overlooks the fact that selection is—necessarily—a population-level process rather than a force that acts on individual entities. But these are merely qualifications, not vanquishers, of the artifact model. His conclusion, restated throughout the book, is

that artifact thinking in biology is often useful but “needs to proceed with caution.”

This much will, I suspect, seem familiar to most biologists. On the other hand, the heart of the book is an in-depth analysis of “function talk” in biology, which is likely to test the resolve of even the most interested reader. Puzzles about the meaning and proper ascription of functions have generated a large technical literature in the philosophy of biology, along with a number of competing accounts of how functions are to be understood. Lewens carefully sorts through these accounts, pointing out the strengths and weaknesses of each, finally noting somewhat anticlimactically that the results of their applications to real-world examples rarely diverge. Still, readers stand to learn something worthwhile along the way from Lewens’s penetrating discussions of fundamental issues in evolutionary biology, including the sense in which selection explains (and fails to explain) adaptations, the differing meanings of *adaptationism*, the promise and pitfalls

of evolutionary reverse engineering, and the role of development in evolution.

Readers expecting a wide-ranging discussion of "design in nature and elsewhere," however, of the sort one might get from a work in popular science, are likely to be disappointed. The book is not so much about design in nature in some inclusive sense as it is about design talk in biology. Moreover, the discussion of design elsewhere is for the most part confined to the last chapter, which addresses similarities and differences between biological evolution and technological change. There Lewens applies the results of the previous chapters to the question of technological change and to the claims of "intelligent design creationism," showing first that enthusiasts for evolutionary models of technological change need to be cautious in using concepts from biological evolution to explain the intentional creation of artifacts and, second, that, viewed in light of the foregoing discussions, the central claims of intelligent design creationism are quite simply eviscerated. This important take-home message is perhaps the chief value of the book for the general reader. While creationists are busy trying to convince anyone who will listen that we live in a world of nature by design, Lewens shows how biologists (and philosophers) are engaged in the much more interesting enterprise of describing, explaining, pondering, and debating the myriad forms of design by nature. What could be more inspiring than that?

TIMOTHY SHANAHAN  
*Department of Philosophy*  
*Loyola Marymount University*  
*Los Angeles, CA 90045*



## NEW TITLES

### **Apoptosis: The Life and Death of Cells.**

Christopher Potten and James Wilson. Cambridge University Press, New York, 2004. 224 pp. \$39.99 (ISBN 052162579X paper).

### **Cases in Human Parasitology.**

Judith S. Heelan. ASM Press, Washington, DC, 2004. 256 pp., illus. \$59.95 (ISBN 1555812961 paper).

### **DNA Sequencing: Optimizing the Process and Analysis.**

Jan Kieleczawa, ed. Jones and Bartlett, Boston, 2004. 224 pp., illus. \$89.95 (ISBN 0763747823 cloth).

### **Evolving Eden: An Illustrated Guide to the Evolution of the African Large-Mammal Fauna.**

Alan Turner and Mauricio Anton. Columbia University Press, New York, 2004. 269 pp., illus. \$39.50 (ISBN 0231119445 cloth).

### **Forest Canopies,**

2nd ed. Margaret D. Lowman and H. Bruce Rinker. Academic Press, Boston, 2004. 544 pp., illus. \$79.95 (ISBN 0124575536 cloth).

### **From Apocalypse to Way of Life.**

Frederick Buell. Routledge, New York, 2004. 400 pp. \$22.95 (ISBN 0415950406 paper).

### **Frozen Earth: The Once and Future Story of the Ice Ages.**

Doug Macdougall. University of California Press, Berkeley, 2004. 256 pp., illus. \$24.95 (ISBN 0520239229 cloth).

### **Gardens of New Spain: How Mediterranean Plants and Foods Changed America.**

William W. Dunmire. University of Texas Press, Austin, 2004. 375 pp., illus. \$24.95 (ISBN 0292705646 paper).

### **Global Warming: The Complete Briefing,**

3rd ed. John Houghton. Cambridge University Press, New York, 2004. 382 pp., illus. \$45.00 (ISBN 0521528747 paper).

### **Hollows, Peepers, and Highlanders: An Appalachian Mountain Ecology,**

2nd ed. George Constantz. West Virginia University Press, Morgantown, 2004. 150 pp., illus. \$18.50 (ISBN 0937058866 paper).

### **Infections of Leisure,**

3rd ed. David Schlossberg, ed. ASM Press, Washington, DC, 2004. 458 pp., illus. \$59.95 (ISBN 1555812996 paper).

### **The Life and Death of Smallpox.**

Ian and Jenifer Glynn. Cambridge University Press, New York, 2004. 256 pp., illus. \$25.00 (ISBN 0521845424 cloth).

### **Mammalian Host Defense Peptides.**

Deirdre A. Devine and Robert E. W. Hancock, eds. Cambridge University Press, New York, 2004. 408 pp., illus. \$95.00 (ISBN 0521822203 cloth).

### **Methuselah Flies: A Case Study in the Evolution of Aging.**

Michael R. Rose, Hardip B. Passananti, and Magarida Matos. World Scientific, River Edge, NJ, 2004. 450 pp., illus. \$98.00 (ISBN 9812387412 cloth).

### **Mineral Nutrition of Plants: Principles and Perspectives,**

2nd ed. Emanuel Epstein and Arnold J. Bloom. Sinauer, Sunderland, MA, 2004. 400 pp., illus. \$79.95 (ISBN 0878931724 cloth).

### **The Nature of Scientific Evidence: Statistical, Philosophical, and Empirical Considerations.**

Mark L. Taper and Subhash R. Lele, eds. University of Chicago Press, 2004. 448 pp., illus. \$30.00 (ISBN 0226789578 paper).

### **On Human Nature,**

25th anniversary ed. Edward O. Wilson. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA, 2004. 260 pp. \$18.95 (ISBN 0674016386 paper).

### **Online Ecological and Environmental Data.**

Virginia Baldwin, ed. Haworth Press, Binghamton, NY, 2004. 101 pp., illus. \$19.95 (ISBN 0789024470 paper).

**Plant Biochemistry**, 3rd ed. Hans-Walter Heldt. Academic Press, Boston, 2004. 656 pp., illus. \$79.95 (ISBN 0120883910 paper).

**The Structure of Biological Membranes**, 2nd ed. Philip L. Yeagle, ed. CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL, 2004. 576 pp., illus. \$159.95 (ISBN 0849314038 cloth).

**Tropical Forest Diversity and Dynamism: Findings from a Large-Scale Plot Network**. Elizabeth C. Losos and Egbert G. Leigh Jr., eds. University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 2004. 688 pp., illus. \$38.00 (ISBN 0226493466 paper).

**What Good Are Bugs? Insects in the Web of Life**. Gilbert Waldbauer.

Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA, 2004. 384 pp., illus. \$16.95 (ISBN 0674016327 paper).

**Why Some Like It Hot: Food, Genes, and Cultural Diversity**. Gary Paul Nabhan. Island Press, Washington, DC, 2004. 240 pp. \$24.00 (ISBN 1559634669 cloth).